

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CITY COMMISSION
CITY OF EAST GRAND RAPIDS

Regular Meeting Held July 2, 2018

Mayor Seibold called the meeting to order at 6:01 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers at the East Grand Rapids Community Center and led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance.

Present: Commissioners Duncan, Favale, Miller, Walters, Zigel and Mayor Seibold

Absent: Commissioner Hamrick

Also Present: City Attorney Huff; Assistant City Manager LaFave; Zoning Administrator Mizikar; Communications Specialist Greenleaf; City Clerk Brower

2018-79. No public comment was received.

2018-80. Commissioner Walters reminded everyone of the 4th of July activities taking place on Wednesday, including the annual Trail Blazer 5K walk/run which begins at 8:30 am as a fundraiser for the Community Foundation. He noted additional volunteers were needed if anyone was able to work for a few hours.

Commissioners Miller and Favale looked forward to all of the events on the 4th of July as well.

Commissioner Zigel announced Clean Juice will open in Gaslight Village later this month.

Mayor Seibold also invited everyone to all the wonderful events planned for July 4.

2018-81. Election of President for FY 2018-19.

2018- -A. Zigel-Duncan. That Commissioner Miller be elected President of the East Grand Rapids City Commission to assume leadership duties in the absence of the Mayor for FY 2018-19.

Yeas: Duncan, Favale, Miller, Walters, Zigel and Seibold – 6

Nays: -0-

2018-82. A zoning variance hearing was held regarding the request of Rusty Ross of 750 San Jose to allow the construction of an addition to the home with a side yard setback of 3.6' instead of the required 7.0' and a combined side yard setback of 12.7' instead of the required 18.0.'

Zoning Administrator Mizikar noted it was his understanding this request had been withdrawn by the applicant. No one was present to speak about this request, so it was removed from the agenda.

2018-83. A zoning variance hearing was held regarding the request of Joseph Gavin of 2510 Lake Drive to allow the construction of a detached garage with a side yard setback of 1.4' instead of the required 3.0.'

Zoning Administrator Mizikar explained the request to tear down the existing garage and build a wider and deeper garage. He noted there did not appear to be any special conditions or circumstances peculiar to this property and that the new garage would not be a substantial detriment to surrounding properties.

Joseph Gavin, 2510 Lake Drive, explained the request and noted the structure would be too close to the property line due to the angle of the lot line.

Mayor Seibold opened a public hearing. No public comment was received. Mayor Seibold closed the public hearing.

- 2018- -A. Miller-Favale. That the request of Joseph Gavin of 2510 Lake Drive to allow the construction of a detached garage with a side yard setback of 1.4' instead of the required 3.0' be approved.

Commissioner Walters stated that he understood why the applicant wished to build a larger garage and did not see it as a substantial detriment to the neighboring property; however, he noted there was currently a two-stall garage on this property so it could obviously be done within the ordinance without requiring a variance. Mr. Walters noted that since he did not feel the standard requiring special conditions were met, he would not be voting in favor of the variance.

Commissioner Miller agreed, stating he believed there were alternatives that would not need a variance. He was also concerned about the proximity to the property line and the neighbor's garage.

Commissioner Duncan also felt the garage could be smaller or located differently to avoid needing a variance.

Mayor Seibold noted the request could be tabled to allow Mr. Gavin's builder to attend the meeting to address the specifics of why the garage could not be built without a variance.

- 2018- -B. Walters-Miller. That the request of Joseph Gavin of 2510 Lake Drive to allow the construction of a detached garage with a side yard setback of 1.4' instead of the required 3.0' be tabled to allow the applicant time to consult with his contractor.

Yeas: Duncan, Favale, Miller, Walters, Zagel and Seibold – 6

Nays: -0-

- 2018-84. Resolution regarding Right-of-Way permit on Oxford Road for the proposed 2200 Griggs Street Development.

Assistant City Manager LaFave explained the city had received preliminary plans for a multi-family housing development south of the city limits in Grand Rapids that proposed access through Oxford Street in East Grand Rapids. While formal plans have not yet been submitted to the City of Grand Rapids or the Michigan Department of Environmental Quality, EGR staff had commissioned a review of the developer's traffic study by an independent consultant. While only the Oxford access was included in the traffic study, EGR's consultant concluded there was no constraint to accessing the proposed development from Griggs Street within Grand Rapids. Mr. LaFave noted the city attorney had prepared a resolution for consideration outlining reasons the city would not approve a right of way access permit through Oxford Road based on the current development proposal. Mr. LaFave noted that East Grand Rapids has authority over the right of way access permit, but does not have authority over the MDEQ process or approval or over the site plan review process that will be undertaken by the City of Grand Rapids.

City Attorney Huff noted the City Commission would not normally be considering an access permit until an application is formally submitted, but due to the strong concerns from the residents of the area, staff placed the item on this agenda to seek input on the traffic impact of the proposed development.

Assistant City Manager LaFave reiterated that East Grand Rapids doesn't have authority over the site plan process or the wetlands mitigation proposal, but can give input to the City of Grand Rapids on the traffic impact of the development as it is currently proposed. The proposed resolution is only an advisory step and East Grand Rapids may have to formally consider this access request at a later date if the developer submits a formal proposal.

Ron Redick of Mika Meyers, representing Oxford Hamlet, LLC, requested that the City Commission table the proposed resolution in order to research the various issues raised in his letter earlier in the day. He noted it was very unusual for a commission to act in an advisory capacity, especially since there was no specific proposal pending. He quoted from the traffic study and the city's traffic consultant to argue the traffic impact will be the same no matter where access is placed. He showed a copy of the original plat map and noted that access to a public street should be available to all, not just residents of East Grand Rapids. Mr. Redick indicated the developer would pursue the matter in court if necessary.

Mayor Seibold opened a public hearing. The following people were present to express their opinions:

- Frank Spies, 2122 Tenway Requested the city commission adopt the resolution as proposed due to the traffic impact on already congested streets in the area. Noted on-street parking, the nearby school and heavy volume on Breton Road already impact traffic in their neighborhood. Submitted petition from property owners.
- Gary Barnes, 1720 Oxford Agreed it is already difficult to access Breton at some times and this dense development would make it worse.
- Jeff Lloyd, 1779 Breton Any additional traffic will make accessing Breton worse. Felt it was already a problem area and residents often circle the block to avoid turning left off Englewood onto Breton.
- John Corbett, 1630 Oxford Stated 425 trips per day from the new development will be a significant change for this area. Asked that other access points be explored.
- Kevin Hagler, 1771 Warwick Asked how the development would be serviced by police and fire for emergencies. Felt it would be easier if accessed from Grand Rapids streets.
- Cathy Cohen, 1750 Whitfield Noted that the wear and tear on East streets from the vehicles should not be paid by East. Noted there have been repeated traffic issues in the past in this area and more vehicles would make it worse.
- Bill Andrus, 1779 Asbury Disputed the “insignificant impact” conclusion. Objected to the traffic, maintenance and wetlands impact of the development.
- William Johnson, 1770 Oxford Felt Oxford would be overwhelmed with cars. Asked to see the materials submitted by Mika Meyers.
- Sara Forist, 2050 Tenway Noted the impact on Tenway Street was not studied; would be significant for this quiet street. Felt there was no benefit to East Grand Rapids.
- Courtney Moskal, 2041 Tenway Stated this was a quiet neighborhood sometimes forgotten because of the dead-end streets. Wanted to keep the area as it is now.
- Jenna Ludeman, 2258 Englewood Requested the city reject the access request. Stated the city advertises safe neighborhoods, but additional traffic will impact safety. This will also impact the infrastructure.
- Ray Fisher, 2108 Tenway Stated traffic from 55 units will adversely impact the entire neighborhood.
- Eric Gollanek, 2354 Englewood Noted that original plat maps show low-density single family homes on large lots, not high-density housing. Adding 420 trips per day is definitely significant.
- David Neuhaus, 1771 Whitfield Noted many streets were not included in the traffic study and disagreed with the conclusion that there aren’t backups with the current situation. Liked the resolution because it sends a message to the developer to look at all options.
- Sean Corcorran, 2225 Englewood Stated parking on the street often creates bottlenecks and backups on area streets and would be worse with additional vehicles.
- Randy Flood, 1764 Whitfield Turning left onto Breton is already tricky and time consuming. Crossing on foot is often impossible. Felt safety was the main concern if more traffic is added.
- Melissa Conway, 1700 Laurel Noted traffic to and from Breton Downs school at certain times of the day was very heavy and was her biggest concern with children walking to school. Requested that all other access points be studied.

- Matt Ludeman, 2258 Englewood Stated there was already a lot of traffic in the area and some narrow points make it worse. Supported adopting the resolution to send input that this was not the right proposal.
- Jenny Moo, 2144 Tenway Englewood and Breton are already very busy with few stop signs to slow traffic. Already dangerous for kids in the area.
- Kris Andrus, 1779 Asbury High-density housing is not suited for this area, especially with the extraordinary increase in traffic.
- Tom Hesselschwerdt, 2136 Tenway Noted that emergency vehicles, snowplows and garbage trucks will all have to travel through their neighborhoods. Felt access off Breton or Griggs would make more sense.

The following communications were received at City Hall concerning this variance request:

- | | |
|---|--|
| Kari Wilson, 1771 Asbury | Opposed to development. |
| Michael & Mary Cook, 2342 Elliott | Opposed to development. |
| Bill & Kris Andrus, 1779 Asbury | Opposed to development. |
| Marshall Battani, 1771 Asbury | Opposed to development. |
| J.D. Collins | Opposed to development. |
| Gary Barnes, 1720 Oxford | Opposed to development. |
| Allison Hutt, 2330 Argentina | Opposed to development. |
| Jenna Ludeman 2258 Englewood | Opposed to development. |
| Jennifer Moo, 2144 Tenway | Opposed to development. |
| Ken Kranz, 2150 Tenway | Opposed to development. |
| Nicholas Kurpansky, 2450 Maplewood | Opposed to development. |
| Janet Cocciarelli, Elliott Street | Opposed to development. |
| Patricia Beck | Opposed to development. |
| Sue Keil, Amberley Ct | Opposed to development. |
| George McBane, 1750 Asbury | Opposed to development. |
| Susanne Buchau, 1750 Asbury | Opposed to development. |
| Patrick Gerkin, 2341 Englewood | Opposed to development. |
| Kathy & Matthew MacGregor, 2222 Englewood / 1748 Oxford | Opposed to development. |
| Anne Fox, 1775 Warwick | Opposed to development. |
| Elizabeth Woods, 1770 Warwick | Opposed to development. |
| Jordan Powers, 2326 Englewood | Opposed to development. |
| Elizabeth Christopherson, 1622 Amberley | Opposed to development. |
| Natalie Owen, owner of 1740 Vesta | Opposed to development. |
| Patrick Coulston, 2350 Englewood | Opposed to development. |
| Wyatt Martin, Greenridge Realty | Opposed to development. |
| Julie & George Payne, 1754 Oxford | Opposed to development. |
| Adam Ophoff, 2115 Tenway | Opposed to development. |
| Ronald Redick, Mika Meyers | Raised legal questions. |
| Commissioner Hamrick, 2nd Ward | Felt traffic should be placed on GR streets. |
| Petition submitted by Frank Spies | 156 signatures opposing development |

No other public comment was received. Mayor Seibold closed the public hearing.

- 2018- -A. Duncan-Zagel. That a resolution 1) agreeing with the findings of the City’s traffic engineer regarding the location of the ingress and egress to the proposed development, and 2) stating the City of East Grand Rapids would not approve a right of way permit from the developer of the proposed 2200 Griggs Street Development allowing access to Oxford Road in the City of East Grand Rapids if such request was based on the current development proposal, be adopted as attached in Exhibit “A.”

Commissioner Duncan stated that the resolution will convey the concerns of the East Grand Rapids residents and officials to the City of Grand Rapids as they work through any request submitted for this development. She felt that there is already a lot of vehicle and pedestrian traffic in this area and adding a high-density development would not be compatible with the congested situation, especially if there are other options

available. She requested that the developer provide additional information on different access points and the traffic impact on additional streets in the area as has been requested by EGR staff on several occasions. She read an email from Commissioner Hamrick stating that she felt that traffic generated by the development should be placed on Grand Rapids streets.

Commissioner Zagel noted the new Master Plan calls for multi-family development near Gaslight Village, but not in neighborhoods made up of only single-family homes. He agreed that the traffic study is incomplete and should be updated to show alternate access points and the traffic impact on additional surrounding streets.

Commissioner Miller noted the City has a responsibility to review traffic proposals that will impact its residents. He stated there are many instances where access has been shared with Grand Rapids where the residential styles have matched the existing homes. He felt that adding a high-density development in this area of existing single-family homes will be difficult. Mr. Miller disagreed with the traffic study's conclusion that Oxford will see an insignificant impact from a development that will add 55 homes to a street with only 6 homes currently. He felt the resolution accurately conveys the concerns and encourages everyone involved to find a better solution. He noted he fully supports multi-family housing in areas with the correct infrastructure and traffic capacity, but did not feel that it would fit in this particular neighborhood.

Commissioner Walters agreed with the concerns noted above and stated this proposal would have major traffic implications for residents. He also noted it would more difficult for emergency vehicles and maintenance operations to access this area efficiently. Mr. Walters stated that while an unusual step, he supported the resolution as a way to communicate our concerns to everyone involved in the project.

Commissioner Favale also supported the resolution and asked for a more complete traffic study. She felt any development on this property should impact Grand Rapids and East Grand Rapids equally.

Mayor Seibold also supported the resolution as a way to advise Grand Rapids of the concerns of the city officials and residents as they move through the process. She felt any increase in traffic will affect every street in this area. She felt it was very unusual to propose a large, dense development in one city with the only access through another city. She has not seen any documentation on why this is the only or the best option. Mayor Seibold noted that adding additional traffic on Breton is also a concern. She encouraged the developer to take the time to look at all of the options and the input given by residents and staff.

Yeas: Duncan, Favale, Miller, Walters, Zagel and Seibold – 6
Nays: -0-

2018-85. Request for placement of temporary “No Parking” signs on Manhattan Road.

Assistant City Manager LaFave explained that residents have requested temporary parking restricts due to a large construction project on their streets.

Mayor Seibold opened a public hearing. The following people were present to express their opinions:

- Carla Boyd, 645 Manhattan Rd	Requested assistance with on street parking due to three large construction projects on their street starting this year that create pinch points, blocked driveways and traffic bottlenecks. Noted the construction will likely last longer than November.
--------------------------------	--

2018- -A. Walters-Miller. That the request to place temporary “No Parking” signs on the north and west side of Manhattan Road south of Pioneer Club through November 16, 2018 be approved as requested.

Commissioner Miller thanked the neighbors for organizing this request and working with the city to solve the issue. He stated he would be willing to consider an extension of the no parking signs in November if needed.

Yeas: Duncan, Favale, Miller, Walters, Zagel and Seibold – 6
Nays: -0-

2018-86. Zagel-Favale. To approve the consent agenda as follows:

2018- -. To approve the minutes of the regular meeting held June 18, 2018.

2018- -A. To approve payroll disbursements of \$221,009.39; county and school disbursements of \$-0-, and total remaining disbursements of \$529,566.03.

2018- -B. Advisory board appointments as follows:

Planning Commission	John Arendshorst, 2056 Wilshire Michael Naltner, 1661 Fisk	Three-year terms ending 6/30/21
Parks & Recreation Comm.	Nicholas Abraham, 1108 Lakeside Brad Andrzejewski, 3105 Bonnell Carol Campbell, 2109 Elmwood Elizabeth Mitchell, 1146 San Jose Aaron Smith, 1645 Laurel Richard Sprague, Jr., 2332 Burchard Adam Rogalski, 933Lakeside	One-year terms ending 6/30/19
Library Commission	Micki Benz, 817 Gladstone Betsy Brown, 1410 Sherwood Carol Donovan, 2944 Hall Judy Freeman, 425 Cambridge Charles Myers, 1050 Monterey Christopher Smith, 461 Lakeside	One-year terms ending 6/30/19
Board of Review	Paul Howland, 2809 Woodcliff Circle Andrea Borden, 1445 Breton	Two-year terms ending 6/30/20

Yeas: Duncan, Favale, Miller, Walters, Zagel and Seibold – 6

Nays: -0-

The meeting adjourned at 7:48 p.m., subject to the call of the Mayor until July 16, 2018.

Karen K. Brower, City Clerk

Attachments: A – Resolution regarding the 2200 Griggs Street development

Attachments listed above are available for inspection at the office of the City Clerk.